

2020

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission

Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

Thursday, March 12, 2020

**3rd Floor Conference Room, Planning and Development Services
Department, Public Works Building, 201 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona
85701.**

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 1:00 P.M., and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair), Michael Becherer Sharon Chadwick, and Jan Mulder.

Commissioners Absent/Excused: Jim Sauer, Helen Erickson, and Jill Jenkins .

Staff Members Present: Michael Taku, Jodie Brown, Dan Bursuck and Ben Carpenter (PDSD).

2. Approval of the Legal Action Report (LAR) from Meeting(s) of 2-27-20

It was moved by Commissioner Mulder, duly seconded by Commissioner Becherer, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to approve the Legal Action Report from the meeting of 2-27-20 as submitted.

3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

**HPZ 19-97, 1043-1045 North 2nd Avenue
West University Historic Preservation Zone, Non-Contributing Resource**

Construction of new additions, replacement of windows and doors.
[Zoning Violation].

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the continuance recommendation from the PRS meeting of 2-13-20 to allow

the applicant to return with revised design solution to mitigate concerns raised about hiding the entry from public view.

David Stewart, Chrysalis Design presented project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Mulder , duly seconded by Commissioner Becherer, and passed by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend approval of revised design as presented.

**HPZ 20-012, 560 and 576 S. Convent Avenue (Zoning Violation)
Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone- Contributing Resource**

Installation of seventeen (17) additional canales to the three (3) approved on the east façade and replacement of light fixtures above the entrances, [Zoning Violation, Continued Case 2-27-20].

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the continuation recommendation of PRS from the meeting of 02-27-20 to return with a roof drainage plan to justify additional canales and a water management plan on the adobe building.

Keri Silvyn, land use attorney, introduced the roof drainage revisions and water management mitigation plan. Silvyn noted that the proposal is to keep the three (3) functional scuppers/canales and remove ten (10) of the unpermitted non-functional scuppers/canales. The additional seven (7) decorative scuppers/canals will be spaced to reflect the spacing pattern within the Barrio and will not be placed over windows or doors. Silvyn concluded that the revision shows owner's good faith to comply and desire to add aesthetics to the property.

Architects Kegan Tom, and Richard Fe Tom discussed the site plan, current roof configuration, drainage pattern and how the drainage will be managed to protect the historic building. Kegan Tom explained how the proposed catch basin and rip rap will drain the ground level water away from the building, thereby, reducing further damage to the adobe building.

Discussion was held. Subcommittee reiterated that the canales are decorative and mainly for aesthetics and not needed for drainage. The consensus was that proposed additional seven (7) scuppers/canales are not required for drainage. Additionally, subcommittee noted that allowing scuppers/canals as architectural decorative treatment on a contributing historic building is not recommended by *"The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation"*. Finally, subcommittee stated the permitted three (3) scuppers/canals are sufficient for roof drainage and with

proposed ground level water treatment the adobe building can be adequately preserved. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Chadwick, and passed by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend denial of the seven (7) additional decorative scuppers/canales as presented.

PDSD staff presentation and discussion of Flexible Lot Development (FLD).
UDC 8.7/Administrative Manual 2-06.5

PDSD staff Dan Bursuck presented an overview of the Flexible Lot Development.

HPZ 19-98, 811-821 South 4th Avenue
Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone, Contributing and Non-Contributing Resource
Parcel 117-08-040B
Lot #1, Existing Contributing Home, Victorian Bungalow
Lots #4&5, New Duplex (Buildings) #4 &5
Portion of Lot #6, New Building #6

Note: HPZ-19-98, 99, and 100 were reviewed together, but separate motions were made regarding each case.

Staff Taku introduced the review and read into the record the continuation recommendation of PRS from the meeting of 01-23-20. Staff provided subcommittee with a copy of a site plan (sheet G24) showing existing parcel numbers, proposed lots numbers and location of existing and proposed new buildings on the proposed lots.

Architect Bill Mackey from Worker, Inc. presented an overview of the proposed redevelopment project that would combine three current parcels with two contributing structures into a new FLD project. Architect Mackey described the buildings on each of the seven (7) lots. Lot #1: Existing contributing Victorian Bungalow home. Lot #2: New building with brick, stucco and standing seam metal roof. Lot #3: New building with a height of 14'8" to be consistent with height in development zone. Lots #4 & #5: New duplex, stucco sand finish with standing seam roof. Lot #6: New building with stucco finish and exposed brick masonry. Lot #7: Existing Transformed Sonoran contributing building with a rusted corrugated roof and a mesquite fence. Applicant stated the density is seven (7) units per acre and consistent with the development zone pattern.

Discussion was held. Subcommittee was satisfied with clarity provided on height (Sheet G23), roof types, details mesquite fencing, buildings details

and placement on the lots, and documentation (sheet G25) on the Railroad Avenue façade. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and passed by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend approval as presented.

HPZ 19-99, 811-821 South 4th Avenue

Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone, Non-Contributing Resource

Parcel 117-08-040A

Portion of Lot #2; Portion of Building #2-no new full building proposed

Portion of Lot #6; Portion of Building #6-No new full building proposed

Portion of Lot #7; Portion of Building #7-No New full building proposed

Staff Taku introduced the review and read into the record the continuation recommendation of PRS from the meeting of 01-23-20. Staff provided subcommittee with a copy of a site plan (sheet G24) showing existing parcel numbers, proposed lots numbers and location of existing and proposed new buildings on the proposed lots.

Architect Bill Mackey from Worker, Inc. presented an overview of the proposed redevelopment project that would combine three current parcels with two contributing structures into a new FLD project. Architect Mackey described the buildings on each of the seven (7) lots. Lot #1: Existing contributing Victorian Bungalow home. Lot #2: New building with brick, stucco and standing seam metal roof. Lot #3: New building with a height of 14'8" to be consistent with height in development zone. Lots #4 & #5: New duplex, stucco sand finish with standing seam roof. Lot #6: New building with stucco finish and exposed brick masonry. Lot #7: Existing Transformed Sonoran contributing building with a rusted corrugated roof and a mesquite fence. Applicant stated the density is seven (7) units per acre and consistent with the development zone pattern.

Discussion was held. Subcommittee was satisfied with clarity provided on height (Sheet G23), roof types, details mesquite fencing, buildings details and placement on the lots, and documentation (sheet G25) on the Railroad Avenue façade. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and passed by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend approval as presented.

HPZ 19-100, 811-821 S. 4th Avenue

Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone, Contributing and Non-Contributing Resource

Parcel 117-08-0440

Lot #2, New Building #2

Lot #3, New Building #3

Lot #7, Existing Contributing Home, Transformed Sonoran

Staff Taku introduced the review and read into the record the continuation recommendation of PRS from the meeting of 01-23-20. Staff provided subcommittee with a copy of a site plan (sheet G24) showing existing parcel numbers, proposed lots numbers and location of existing and proposed new buildings on the proposed lots.

Architect Bill Mackey from Worker, Inc. presented an overview of the proposed redevelopment project that would combine three current parcels with two contributing structures into a new FLD project. Architect Mackey described the buildings on each of the seven (7) lots. Lot #1: Existing contributing Victorian Bungalow home. Lot #2: New building with brick, stucco and standing seam metal roof. Lot #3: New building with a height of 14'8" to be consistent with height in development zone. Lots #4 & #5: New duplex, stucco sand finish with standing seam roof. Lot #6: New building with stucco finish and exposed brick masonry. Lot #7: Existing Transformed Sonoran contributing building with a rusted corrugated roof and a mesquite fence. Applicant stated the density is seven (7) units per acre and consistent with the development zone pattern.

Discussion was held. Subcommittee was satisfied with clarity provided on height (Sheet G23), roof types, details mesquite fencing, buildings details and placement on the lots, and documentation (sheet G25) on the Railroad Avenue façade. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and passed by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend approval as presented.

4. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

a. Minor Reviews

Staff provided an update on reviews conducted in Armory Park. Next reviews are at 812 S 4th Avenue (Mechanical) and 375 S Stone Avenue (Rezoning condition).

b. Appeals

None at this time.

c. Zoning Violations

Staff provided information on ongoing and pending cases being worked on for compliance. Specifically, 541 S. Main Avenue (change in construction plans).

d. Review Process Issues/Discussions

All reviews are on hold.

5. Call to the Audience (Information Only)

No one spoke.

6. Schedule and Future Items for Upcoming Meetings

All City Boards, Commissions are on hold till March 31, 2020.

7. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 2:30 P.M.